Reducing the Dangers of Nuclear War

Elaine Scarry
Harvard University

Democracy and Nuclear Weapons Cannot Co-Exist
Alfred Eisenstaedt, “Mother and Child in Hiroshima, Japan, December 1945.” Getty Images
SO MANY EXIST READY TO BE USED

The World’s Nuclear Warheads Count

Russia 7,500
US 7,200

Decrease from 2014: ~700

PCU Nagasaki Council for Nuclear Weapons Abolition (PCU-NCA) / Research Center for Nuclear Weapons Abolition, Nagasaki University (RECA)
Created by: RECA Nuclear Warheads Data Monitoring Team
For more information, please visit: http://www.reca.nagasaki-u.ac.jp/
Numbers are rounded.
The World's Nuclear Warheads Count

15,700
The World's Nuclear Warheads Count
Injury to the Persons and to Earth

International Law prohibits this injury

International Law solves the problem of “statistical compassion”

National Law solves the problem of “statistical compassion”
Nuclear Weapons Free Zones
International Law and Policy Institution

Status of Nuclear Weapons Free Zones

- Full Party to Nuclear Weapons Free Zone Treaty
- Signatory to Nuclear Weapons Free Zone Treaty - Ratification remains
- Not Parties to any Nuclear Weapons Free Zone Treaty
- NPT Nuclear Weapons State ratification status (add. protocols)

Treaty of Semey *
- PS adherence: 🟠🟠🟠

Treaty of Rarotonga
- PS adherence: 🟠🟠

Treaty of Tlatelolco
- 1967 (c: 1968) (Act 33) (Act 33)
- PS adherence: 🟠🟠

Treaty of Pelindaba
- 1986 (c: 1990) (Act 51) (Act 30)
- PS adherence: 🟠🟠

- Mongolian Nuclear Free Territory - Recognized by UN General Assembly
- South Sudan - Yet to sign and ratify The Pelindaba Treaty
- Antarctic Treaty - Demilitarized Territory, including Nuclear Weapons
John Ainslie *Disarming Trident*
Timetable

- Nuclear warheads deployed at sea: ZERO in 7 days
- Nuclear warheads on submarines: ZERO in 2 months
- Nuclear warheads in Scotland: ZERO in 2 years
- Nuclear warheads in Britain: ZERO in 4 years
THERMONUCLEAR MONARCHY

CHOOSING BETWEEN DEMOCRACY AND DOOM

ELAINE SCARRY
• Two brakes on warmaking in U.S. Constitution

First brake: Article 1 section 8 clause 11
No war without a Congressional “Declaration of War”

Second brake: Second Amendment
What are the formal features of a Congressional “Declaration of War” in the five cases where the U.S. has had a declaration?

- War of 1812 (with England)
- Mexican-American War 1846
- Spanish American War 1898
- World War I
- World War II

What are the formal features of presidential deliberation about using a nuclear weapon?

- Taiwan Straits Crisis 1954
- Berlin Crisis 1959
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Congressional Deliberation</th>
<th>vs.</th>
<th>Presidential Deliberation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Visible to the Public</td>
<td></td>
<td>Invisible to Public for thirty years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clear set of sentences</td>
<td></td>
<td>No clear statement of action</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conspicuously staged vote</td>
<td></td>
<td>No vote</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participants equal</td>
<td></td>
<td>Participants are subordinates</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dissent and contestation:</td>
<td></td>
<td>No dissent. No contestation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Testing</td>
<td></td>
<td>No testing.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
• **Second Brake:** The Right to Bear Arms

1. Constitution arranges for many “intervening layers of resistant humanity”

2. Resistant humanity? Do soldiers dissent?

3. Second Amendment arrives during ratification of Constitution: A distributional requirement created during distributional moment

4. Supported by militarists and pacifists alike

5. Civil stature in U.S. is premised on military stature 15th, 19th, and 26 Amendments
• **Double brake** provides two gates of authorization

• Double location is what differentiates statutory law from Constitutional law: Constitutional law requires passage by Congress and ratification by population

• 5000 amendments proposed; 27 passed

War making requires passage by Congress and ratification by population
Constitutions of Other Nuclear States

French Constitution
Article 35
Article 89

Indian Constitution
Article 246

Russian Federation Constitution (1993)
Article 102
Article 59
LEVIATHAN
Or
THE MATTER, FORMER
and Power of A Common, WEALTH ECONOMIALLY, and CIVIL.
By Thomas Hobbes of Malmesbury.

London Printed for Andrew Crooke 1651
Non est potestas super Terram quae Comparetur ei Iob 41:24.
At the close of the *Second Treatise of Government* (in the chapter examining the legitimate grounds for rebellion), Locke quotes a memorable observation about one of history’s tyrants: “And of Caligula . . . he wisht that the people had but one neck, that he might dispatch them all at a blow.” Nuclear weapons and the highly practiced arrangements for their use have made Caligula’s wish come true: the people of earth now have but one neck and can be dispatched all at a blow. It does not matter that the thermonuclear monarchs who preside over us today are ordinarily much nicer people than Caligula, for it is the nuclear architecture itself that literalizes and monumentalizes Caligula; the individual personalities of our monarchs, and the always amusing differences among them, are at best a temporary check on a vast structure of cruelty that stands ready to be used. It is national monarchs, not terrorists, who have put this in place and readied it for use, whether by themselves or by stateless actors. And it is these colossal structures of illegitimate non-governance that must be dismantled.
Meridel Rubenstien  “Nuclear Trigger”  1993
Imagine that there one day came to exist on earth—sometime in the future—a solitary country with a new technology. The technology has let this solitary country station a door (or more precisely, a series of doors) under the floor of every other country in the world.

If the leader of the solitary country ever feels imperiled or impeded by another country, he can open the trap door and, in a single day, eliminate the population of that rival country. Because the arrangement of doors beneath each national floor is sectioned, the leader can alter- natively choose to eliminate just part of the enemy country, a fourth of it, or a third of it; he might choose to open the doors beneath the floor of the opponent’s military installations only, thereby eliminating those installations and, say, one-thirtieth of the country’s population. As a shorthand, this ingenious technology and the policies that enable its use might be called the Flexible Floor Doctrine.
Architect Carolina Dayer’s Rendering of “The Floor of the World”
Architect Magdalena Egues’s Rendering of “The Floor of the World”
Though it is hard to conceive of an international arrangement with greater asymmetry and therefore greater unfairness, the advanced country might come to think of itself as fair, even as the fairest of nations, for it each day has the power to annihilate millions of people and each day (or almost each day) abstains from doing so. (Other countries, in its view, seem to hit each other with sticks and stones every chance they get.)

The inhabitants of earth will find it in their interest to agree with the lever country’s description of its own generosity: *they cannot influence whether the flexible floor is absent or present but only whether it stays closed or suddenly drops open beneath them, and they can diminish the chance of its dropping open beneath them by smiling, waving, and, in general, being cooperative and quiet.*
waving, and, in general, being cooperative and quiet
Adriana Ross Architect
Architectural Student Kristine Prochnau’s Rendering of “Floor of the World”

Scientific American “Arctic Beauty in Black and White: Alaska Before the Effects of Global Warming” 8 black and white photographs.

Wired Magazine: “Beautiful Polar Photos Tell a Haunting Story about Climate Change” Photographs by Camille Seaman (and story by Jakob Schiller)

NASA . “Climate Change: Vital Signs of the Planet: Beautiful Earth
WHY WOULD YOU NOTICE?

A single Marguerite seems hardly worth your attention. Why picture this little flower on the inside cover of this magazine, you may wonder, when the space could be used for real information?

But is not everything important encapsulated in this little bud, its color, growth, beauty, and the miracle of life itself. Aware of the dangers of nuclear war pressing upon us, may it not feel as fragile as this flower? And as vulnerable.

But there is a way you can do something about this danger — make a difference — utilize the power inherent in the bud. That is, by joining a group of people who are really doing something.

Pugwash is such a group. Since 1958, scientists from East and West, from Communist, capitalist and third world countries, have been meeting, working towards the breakthroughs that are necessary if we are to stave off nuclear war. Without publicity, without fanfare, they have been responsible for some of the most significant developments of the past twenty-five years.

Based on the principle that scientists have a way of thinking and problem solving that allows them to communicate with one another across barriers of nationality and ideology, Pugwash offers a real — a proven — hope.

A crucial meeting is scheduled for Geneva this summer, but there is a problem.

Pugwash has no vested interest or government support. It relies on people like you to keep it going. Now your help is crucial. Each individual donation will contribute to the success of the Geneva meeting.

By helping Pugwash you make possible the honorarium necessary for an important paper to be produced or provide the travel allowance for a scientist whose work is vital.

Please don't delay. Fill out the form below and become a friend of Pugwash. It is not too late. The Pugwash scientists need your help.
WHY IS PUGWASH LIKE THIS LEAF?

This tiny leaf, with its network of delicate connecting lines, was hardly noticeable when our photographer picked it out of the forest undergrowth.

She chose this leaf to symbolize Pugwash, a small fragile network—a hidden but very precious part of the living community. Pugwash is like this leaf: it is a network of scientists dedicated to peace, dedicated to using their skills to quietly bring it about.

Since 1956, scientists from East and West, from developed and developing countries have been meeting—working to allay the threats to world peace. Working without fanfare or publicity—for twenty-seventy years—in the changing climate of international relations. Pugwash has constantly renewed itself; it has brought forth real contributions when all else failed.

Pugwash scientists have been credited with the SALT breakthroughs, the Non Proliferation treaty, and much else of value that has been done behind the scenes to help keep us from the brink of nuclear war.

NOW the Pugwash scientists need your help. In these perilous times your financial support is necessary to keep Pugwash alive. You—as a reader of the Bulletin—know better than most our present danger. Never has Pugwash been so necessary...and never has its financial health been so imperiled.

The current economic situation threatens Pugwash which has no government or vested interest to support it. Without your help, Pugwash may not survive. So don't delay. Every day makes a difference. Fill out the coupon below, and become a friend of Pugwash. Help keep alive this fragile network of hope.

[Form for making donations and becoming a friend of Pugwash]
Bulletin of the Atomic Scientists

JUNE 1947

HAROLD C. UREY
An Alternative Course for the Control of Atomic Energy

AUSTIN M. BRUES
With the Atomic Bomb Casualty Commission in Japan

YOSHIO NISHINA
A Japanese Scientist Describes Destruction of Cyclotrons

SYLVIA EBENHART
How the American People Feel About the Atomic Bomb

WAR DEPARTMENT THINKING on the Atomic Bomb

HARRISON BROWN
The World Government Movement in the United States

THE SENATE DEBATES Mr. Lilienthal's Confirmation

BOOKS
..................... UN Atomic Energy News

Vol. 3

PRICE: 25 CENTS

No. 6
Bulletin of the Atomic Scientists

OCTOBER 1947

DAVID F. CAVERE
Atomic Power Versus World Security

SENATOR GLEN H. TAYLOR
Is There Some Hope for World Government?

DON K. PRICE
Deficiencies of the National Science Foundation Bill

PETER KIINSS
United Nations Atomic Energy News Review

U.S. REPORTS Distribution of Radioisotopes
Bulletin of the Atomic Scientists

A MAGAZINE FOR SCIENCE AND PUBLIC AFFAIRS

VOLUME VII - NUMBERS 7-8
AUGUST 1951
PRICE FIFTY CENTS

Impure Science
Philip Wylie

Solar Energy
Maria Telkes

Ethics of Scientists
Kathleen Lonsdale

Symposium on World Resources - Atomic Energy Progress in Britain - Technical Programs in Underdeveloped Areas
E. Rabinowitch: Ten Years That Changed the World
H. J. Morgenthau: Is Atomic War Really Impossible?
Bronowski: The Real Responsibilities of the Scientist.
Bulletin of the Atomic Scientists
The Magazine of Science and Public Affairs

April 1963 - 75 Cents

Bulletin of the Atomic Scientists
A Journal of Science and Public Affairs

JANUARY 1964 - 75 CENTS

ANTARCTICA
THE INTERNATIONAL LABORATORY

Soviet Agriculture
THE WORLD OF THE FUTURE

Cybernetics of Population Control
MAN
AND MORE MEN

Defense Against
Ballistic Missiles
BULLETIN
OF THE
ATOMIC
SCIENTISTS
A JOURNAL OF SCIENCE
AND PUBLIC AFFAIRS

OCTOBER 1964 • 75 CENTS

Stop the World. MARCIGELIS:
Notes on the Democratic
Convention. DE JUVENEL:
Technocratic Age in France.
JANOWITZ. WOHLSTETTER.
LALL. ETZIONI. HEITLER.
BULLETIN OF THE ATOMIC SCIENTISTS
A JOURNAL OF SCIENCE AND PUBLIC AFFAIRS

NOVEMBER 1964 • 75 CENTS

LIUSS MENTER: Looking Back.
MLF—A West European View.
LEWIN: At Sea on the Moon.
Soviet and American Scientist Propose Arctic Disarmament.
BERNHARD: Fear Itself. UNESCO Science.
BULLETIN OF THE ATOMIC SCIENTISTS

MAY 1969 • $1.00

SOCIAL CONTROL OF SCIENCE
Lord Blackett, Lee A. DuBridge, George Wald

THE ABM, CHINA AND THE ARMS RACE

CRESCECND IN NOISE
THE MESS IN CIVIL AVIATION

Bethe
Bulletin of the Atomic Scientists

The future of nuclear energy

How the hype could hurt
Can economical be safe?
Nurturing nuclear neophytes
Inside uranium markets
Why Exelon is cautious
The nuclear PR machine
Waste, the 56,000-ton gorilla
Then there’s proliferation
AND MORE

September/October 2008
www.thebulletin.org
IT IS 5 MINUTES TO MIDNIGHT
Bulletin of the Atomic Scientists

Making nuclear energy work
BY ROBERT ROSNER

Curtains for Kyoto
BY GWYN PRINS & STEVE RAYNER

Dusting off disarmament
BY J. PETER SCOBIC

Just before the bomb
AN INTERVIEW WITH PETER SELLARS
Bulletin of the Atomic Scientists

Five minutes to midnight

Freeman Dyson
Jonathan Schell
Martin Rees
K. Eric Drexler
John P. Holdren
Matthew S. Meselson
Bruce G. Blair
Wolfgang K. H. Panofsky

ON DOOMSDAY

January/February 2007
thebulletin.org
IT IS 5 MINUTES TO MIDNIGHT
The Description of Malmesbury or firstlie Meadalfsbury a borough of north Wiltshire both ansient and famous now in th possession & soole jurisdiction of a familie of Antiquitie and Honour viz Sr John Davers of Dansie house knight a membre of the house of Comones this Parliament 1647, wch place is not only Renowned for its natural streintth Seated on a step hill, unclimbable by reason of the manie Rockes extending unto or containing not more ground than what it standeth on and (within lesse than pistoill shotte) surrounded with unforable Rivers. But Also for its unconquered streintth and victorie obtained against the Danes for a long Sedge for Athelstane, a Saxon King (shut up wth in it). Manifest by his Charter, extant there, whose for its Services and fidelitie bestowed besides severall other privileges and immunities verly faire Landes which to this day it enjoyeth and where likewise in testimonie of his affection to soe great a favoure his bodie (at his desire) was Intomb'd: This shewes the direct figure of that Borough or Garson as it stode fortified the 23 Octobre 1646: the day it was demolished by Parliaments order (the whole Kingdom being a little before Redused) when it had stode a firme Garson for Parliament of England (under the Command of Colonneil Nicholas Devereux) 2 years, 4 months, and odd weakes: wch Description or dragt as proper unto the said Sr John Davers (the soile Lord and owner of it) together wth the Cotte of Armes of his familie, the said Cotte presented in acknowledgement of his many noble favours this 10th of April 1648.